What NHTSA's Data Can Tell Us about Unintended Acceleration and Electronic Throttle Control Systems

PRESENTED TO

the Transportation Research Board of the National Academies for its Study of Electronic Vehicle Controls and Unintended Acceleration

PRESENTED BY R. A. Whitfield, Director, Quality Control Systems Corporation, Crownsville, Maryland

October 11, 2010



2009 Lexus ES 350 crashed August 28, 2009





Toyota announces first recall November 25, 2009

NHTSA 12-09 Wednesday, November 25, 2009

Contact: Karen Aldana Telephone: (202) 366-9550

Toyota Announces Fix for Accelerator Pedal Entrapment Problem

The National Highway Traffic Safety Administration today announced that Toyota has identified a vehiclebased remedy to fix a sudden acceleration safety issue involving floor mats trapping accelerator pedals in various Toyota and Lexus models. Toyota announced the recall of these vehicles in early October and said it would soon develop a vehicle-based remedy to reduce the risk of a crash due to accelerator pedal entrapment.

The models involved in the recall are: 2007 to 2010 MY Camry, 2005 to 2010 MY Avalon, 2004 to 2009 MY Prius, 2005-2010 MY Tacoma, 2007-2010 MY Tundra, 2007-2010 MY ES 350, 2006-2010 MY IS 250, and 2006 to 2010 MY IS 350.



Source: NHTSA, Press Release

Theory:

The throttle or electronic control system malfunctions in the recalled Toyota vehicles (NHTSA CAMPAIGN ID Number: 09V388000).



Null Hypothesis I:

There is no indication in consumer safety complaint data of a throttle or electronic control system malfunction in the recalled Toyota models (NHTSA CAMPAIGN ID Number: 09V388000).



See: Toyota Statement to ABC News, November 25, 2009

Null Hypothesis II:

There is no indication in consumer safety complaint data of a throttle or electronic control system malfunction in the related, unrecalled Toyota models.



See: Toyota Statement to ABC News, November 25, 2009

Data tested:

Consumer Safety Complaints to NHTSA for 3 Toyota Models, Before the Saylor Family Crash



Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Accessed August 24, 2009

Makes and models studied – Toyota Camry



With and without ETCS-i



Photo source: Safercar.gov

Makes and models studied – Lexus ES 300 Series



With and without ETCS-i



Photo source: Safercar.gov

Makes and models studied – Toyota Tacoma



With and without ETCS-i



Photo Source: NHTSA



Just west of the Woods Chapel Road exit on I-70, and as I was driving in the outside lane at about 60 m.p.h. in weakday rush hour (5:50 p.m.) traffic on clear and dry provement, a green late-model SUV in the center lane that was approximately ½ car length about of me started to pull over into the lane I was driving in. I braked and swerved to the right to avoid a collision. As I braked and swerved to the right, the Courty suddenly and unexpectedly accelerated. As a consequence, my swerve to the right was far more







Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, ODI Number 10023329

NOTA ZONE MAN INSPECTED VENICLE AND HAVE NOT FOUND ANYTHING WRONG WITH IT. IS TOYOTA ZONE MAN INSPECTED VENICLE AND HAVE NOT FOUND ANYTHING WRONG WITH IT. IS VRONG. WHEN VEHICLE DECLERATED & IT Shot OVER CEARLY STOPSIDE WE RAN OVER DUSKES, KNOCKED OVER 7 FOOT PALM TREE, AND STOPED WHEN IT HIT BUILDING # 450000 WORTH OF DAMAGE THERE AND BURNED TIRE! MARKS ON CEMENT WHERE THIS ALL



THE VEHICLE EXPERIENCED SUDDEN ACCELERATION WHEN THE GEAR WAS SHIFTED FROM PARK TO DRIVE, AND COLLIDED WITH SEVEN OTHER VEHICLES. "B It BEGAN TO RACE WHEN I ATTEMPTED TO PARK IN FRONT OF A RESTRUCTANT - I SHIFTED FROM REVERSE (ROKING-THEN) TO DRIVE - I DELIBERATED PRESSED ON THE ABS BRAKES - THEY ECOMPLETELY FRILED AND THE MOTOR REPT RACINF UNTIL I HIT INTO A CAR PARKED AT A LISHT ON BERARDST AND NY AVE.



WHILE PARKING THE ENGINE STARTED RACING AND CRASHED INTO A WALL IN A PARKING LOT. CAUSE OF PROBLEM HAS NOT BEEN DETERMINED. PLEASE PROVIDE FURTHER DETAILS. *PH The way into dragonal PKg. 14 1000 + car lunged for all of pkg. A



Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2002				
Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR NO	Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR NORTH AMERICA, INC.					
Crash : No	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0				
ODI ID Number : 10008754		Number of Deaths: 0				
Date of Failure: January 14, 2003						
VIN : 4T1BE32K22U						
Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL						
Summary: THE CONSUMER EXPERIENCED SUDDEN ACCELERATION WITH THIS VEHICLE AND A NEWLY PURCHASED 2003 CAMRY. *JB SCC THE CONSUMER STATED THAT HE APPLIED THE BRAKES AND THE VEHICLE CONTINUED TO TRAVEL FORWARD. THE CONSUMER CUT OFF THE IGNITION AND THE VEHICLE FINALLY CAME TO A STOP. *TC						



Example of a consumer safety complaint with a Vehicle Identification Number

Make : TOYOTA	Model : HIGHLANDER	Year : 2009
Manufacturer : TOYOTA N	IOTOR CORPORATION	
Crash : No	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0
ODI ID Number : 1029380	9	Number of Deaths: 0
Date of Failure: June 1, 20	009	
VIN : JTEES42AX92		
Component: POWER TRA	IN	



Toyota's VIN decoding system for 2009

TOYOTA HIGHLANDER TOYOTA HIGHLANDER Hybrid VEHICLE IDENTIFICATION NUMBER CODING SYSTEM Section 1: Manufacturer, Make and Type

	Code	Manufacturer	Make	Туре
1st - 3rd Digits	JTE	Toyota Motor Corporation	Toyota	Multipurpose Passenger Vehicle

Section 2: Vehicle Description Section

		Code	Description
4th Digit Body Type	Body Type	D	5 Door Wagon Two-Wheel Drive
	Е	5 Door Wagon Four-Wheel Drive	
5th Digit Engine Type	S	2GR-FE	
	W	3MZ-FE+1JM, 2FM	
		A	1AR-FE



Vehicle Identification Number decoded by VINDICATOR (Highway Loss Data Institute)





Vehicle Identification Number decoded for the 2009 Toyota Highlander



Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation

CORP

Classification of the Toyota engine family by ETCS-i for the 2009 Highlander

	A	В	C	D	E
1	Year	Make	Model	Engine	ETSC-i
2	2009	Toyota	FJ Cruiser	1GR-FE	Yes
3	2009	Tovota	Highlander	1AR-FE	Yes
4	2009	Toyota	Highlander	2GR-FE	Yes
5	2009	Toyota	Highlander HV	3MZ-FE	Yes

With and without ETCS-i



Source: Safety Research & Strategies, Inc.

Examples of consumer safety complaints 2006 Camry

Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290231 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 27, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE32KX60 Component: SEAT BELTS Cocument Search Document Search Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Fire : No ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Injuries: 0 OD ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Document Search Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Get Summary Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of	Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2006		
Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290231 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 27, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE32KX6U Component: SEAT BELTS Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Cet Summary Make : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Cet Summary Make : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Grash : Yes	Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION				
ODI ID Number : 10290231 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 27, 2009 Image: Cotober 27, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE32KX6U Component: SEAT BELTS Document Search Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 ViN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Get Summary Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K66U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL Tomponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Crash : No	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0		
Date of Failure: October 27, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE32KX6U Component: SEAT BELTS Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Decument Search Document Search Get Summary Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Make : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Get Summary Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: 0ctober 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL Ket Store Sto	ODI ID Number : 10290231		Number of Deaths: 0		
VIN : 4T1BE32KX6U Component: SEAT BELTS Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number :	Date of Failure: October 27, 2009				
Component: SEAT BELTS Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : Yes Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Mumber of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	VIN: 4T1BE32KX6U				
Document SearchGet SummaryCheck to Request Research. Submit below.Get SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : YesFire : NoCrash : YesFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290122Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: December 6, 2006VIN : 4T1BE32K16UComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLCet SummaryDocument SearchGet SummaryCheck to Request Research. Submit below.Get SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoCrash : NoFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: October 28, 2009VIN : 4T1BE30K86UComponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTALLine : Content and	Component: SEAT BELTS				
Check to Request Research. Submit below.Get SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : YesFire : NoCrash : YesFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290122Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: December 6, 2006Vin : 4T1BE32K16UComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLDocument SearchGet SummaryCheck to Request Research. Submit below.Get SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoCrash : NoFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: October 28, 2009Number of Deaths: 0Vin : 4T1BE30K86UComponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Document Search				
Make : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : YesFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290122Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: December 6, 2006Number of Deaths: 0VIN : 4T1BE32K16UComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLDocument SearchGet SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoManufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Injuries: 0Date of Failure: October 28, 2009VIN : 4T1BE30K86UComponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Check to Request Research. Subm	it below.	Get Summary		
Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : YesFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290122Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: December 6, 2006VIN : 4T1BE32K16UComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLDocument SearchGet SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Injuries: 0Date of Failure: October 28, 2009VIN : 4T1BE30K86UComponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2006		
Crash : YesFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290122Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: December 6, 2006Number of Deaths: 0VIN : 4T1BE32K16UComponent: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROLDocument SearchDocument SearchCheck to Request Research. Submit below.Get SummaryMake : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoCrash : NoFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: October 28, 2009VIN : 4T1BE30K86UComponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTALVIN : 4T1BE30K86U	Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR COR	PORATION			
ODI ID Number : 10290122 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Document Search Get Summary Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Crash : Yes	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0		
Date of Failure: December 6, 2006 VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	ODI ID Number : 10290122		Number of Deaths: 0		
VIN : 4T1BE32K16U Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Date of Failure: December 6, 2006				
Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTROL Document Search Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	VIN: 4T1BE32K16U				
Document Search Get Summary Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Transmit Search Search Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL Search	Component: VEHICLE SPEED CONTR	ROL			
Check to Request Research. Submit below. Get Summary Make : TOYOTA Model : CAMRY Year : 2006 Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Trash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Document Search				
Make : TOYOTAModel : CAMRYYear : 2006Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATIONCrash : NoFire : NoNumber of Injuries: 0ODI ID Number : 10290106Number of Deaths: 0Date of Failure: October 28, 2009VIN : 4T1BE30K86UComponent: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Check to Request Research. Subm	it below.	Get Summary		
Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR CORPORATION Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL VIN : 4T1BE30K86U	Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2006		
Crash : No Fire : No Number of Injuries: 0 ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR COR	PORATION			
ODI ID Number : 10290106 Number of Deaths: 0 Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Crash : No	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0		
Date of Failure: October 28, 2009 VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	ODI ID Number : 10290106		Number of Deaths: 0		
VIN : 4T1BE30K86U Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	Date of Failure: October 28, 2009				
Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL	VIN: 4T1BE30K86U				
	Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL				



Examples of consumer safety complaints 2006 Camry

Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2006	
Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR	CORPORATION		
Crash : No	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0	
ODI ID Number : 10290231		Number of Deaths: 0	
Date of Failure: October 27, 2009			
VIN : 4T1BE32KX6U			
Component: SEAT BELTS			
Document Search			
Check to Request Research. S	ubmit below.	Get Summary	
Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2006	
Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR	CORPORATION		
Crash : Yes	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0	
ODI ID Number : 10290122		Number of Deaths: 0	
Date of Failure: December 6, 2006	j		
VIN: 4T1BE32K16U			
Component: VEHICLE SPEED CO	ONTROL	_	
Document Search			
Check to Request Research. Submit below.		Get Summary	
Make : TOYOTA	Model : CAMRY	Year : 2006	
Manufacturer : TOYOTA MOTOR	CORPORATION		
Crash : No	Fire : No	Number of Injuries: 0	
ODI ID Number : 10290106		Number of Deaths: 0	
Date of Failure: October 28, 2009			
VIN: 4T1BE30K86U			
Component: AIR BAGS:FRONTAL			



Methodology:

Compare the percentage of consumer safety complaints related to vehicle speed control in 3 groups for each model in the study



Comparison groups:

1) Unrecalled vehicles <u>without</u> Electronic Throttle Control (ETCS-i)

2) Unrecalled vehicles with ETCS-i

3) Recalled vehicles with ETCS-i



Toyota Camry: Percentage of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2005, 2007





Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Consumer Safety Complaints through August 24, 2009 Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp., January 26, 2010

Toyota Camry: Percentage of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2005, 2007



Toyota Camry: Percentage of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2005, 2007



Toyota Camry: Proportion of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2005, 2007





Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Consumer Safety Complaints through August 24, 2009 Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp., January 26, 2010

Lexus ES 300 Series: % of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2005, 2007



Lexus ES 300 Series: Proportion of Complaints Related to Speed Control, MY 1999-2005, 2007





Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Consumer Safety Complaints through August 24, 2009 Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp., January 26, 2010

Toyota Tacoma: Percentage of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 2002-2003, 2005-2007



Toyota Tacoma: Proportion of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 2002-2003, 2005-2007





Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Consumer Safety Complaints through August 24, 2009 Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp., January 26, 2010

What about the effect of publicity on consumer complaints to NHTSA about related investigations?

If there was an effect, it can't have influenced complaints <u>before</u> the investigations were announced.



Toyota Camry: Percentage of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2003, Before March 3, 2004 (PE04-021Announced)



Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp.

CORP

Lexus ES 300 Series: % of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 1999-2003, Before March 3, 2004 (PE04-021Announced)





Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Consumer Safety Complaints through August 24, 2009 Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp.
Toyota Tacoma: Percentage of Complaints Related to Speed Control, Model Years 2002-2003, 2005-2007, Before January 31, 2008 (DP08-001Announced)



ote that data for model years 2004, 2008, and 2009 are missing due to inadequate documentation of the engine codes. Is a complaint with a "Vehicle Speed Control" component coded really an unintended acceleration complaint?

Certainly not always. Alternative approaches include manual review of the complaint narrative, a computer-based query of keywords, or a combination of these two.



What effect does time in service have?

Control for "years in service."



What about "normalizing" the data?

Calculating rates based on production data is one possibility.



What if you included vehicles without VINs based on the make, model, and model year coded in the complaint?

What if you assumed the Camry and ES 300 series all had ETCS-i beginning in MY 2002?

What if you assumed the Tacomas all had ETCS-i beginning in MY 2003 (even though they don't)?



Toyota Camry: Unintended Acceleration Complaint Rates Per 100K Units Produced. Calculated for First Calendar Year After Model Year Introduction. MY 1998-2007. Prior to 8/28/2009.



Lexus ES 300 Series: Unintended Acceleration Complaint Rates Per 100K Units Produced. Calculated for First Calendar Year After Model Year Introduction. MY 1998-2007. Prior to 8/28/2009.



Compiled by Quality Control Systems Corp.

Toyota Tacoma: Unintended Acceleration Complaint Rates Per 100K Units Produced. Calculated for First Calendar Year After Model Year Introduction. MY 1998-2007. Prior to 8/28/2009.



Some incidents are caused by floor mats and sticky pedals based on consumers' descriptions







Photo Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation

Some incidents are also caused by pedal misapplication based on consumers' descriptions





Photo source: NHTSA

Is a complaint with a "Vehicle Speed Control" component coded really an unintended acceleration complaint?

The association of complaints related to unintended acceleration that are coded as "Vehicle Speed Control" has changed since the Saylor Family crash. Narrative analyses are essential and can be based on key words and phrases.



"Unintended acceleration? They all do it."

In fact, the data show they don't <u>all</u> do it at the same rate.

Rate-based comparisons of UA are helpful when they are based on theories related to actual differences in vehicle design.

Differences in rates of UA may be important clues in focusing engineering analyses on specific problems in design, manufacturing, and testing.



How likely is it that these factors...

- Vehicle Factors: Floor mats Sticky pedals Pedal placement Gated gear shift pattern Ignition switch design
- Driver Factors: Mass hysteria Fraud Old age Youth Inexperience Incompetent drivers

Environmental/Usage Factors

...explain these results when controlling for make/model and years in service?





To the degree that electronic control systems explain large differences in rates of unintended acceleration...



...countermeasures must be directed to the design, manufacture, and testing of these systems.



To the degree that electronic control systems explain large differences in rates of unintended acceleration...



...it is crucial to monitor the performance of these systems for indications of failure.



Guidance for surveillance of "spontaneous reporting systems" is well developed in the scientific literature

Bayesian Data Mining in La	rge Frequency Tables, With an
Application to the FDA S	Spontaneous Reporting System
William DUMOUCHEL	
Avanamo dara mittig tark in the search for ansectations in gentabases. Here we consider the search for "interest- ing ditabases. Here we consider the search for "interest- tion of exits, most of which have an observed frequency in a search frequency for each end, and thest angress at distored frequency for each end, and the search and and the search of the search of the search of the distored frequency for each end over the search of the search of the search of the search of the distored frequency for the search of the distored in its or series the darge exit conditions for poin- der in the search of the distored of the search of the search of the further interception. A search of the search of the search of the search of the distored of the search of the search of the labor. Here "large table" near one holds we condered tables. The "large table" near one holds we condered tables. The "large table" near one holds we condered tables. The "large table" near the search of the	single is a distortion in the energy in a statistic in the second statistic is a statistic in the statistic interpret in the statistic interpret
cate of the variables pine very many categories. This ar- lief focuses on the latter situation and considers the case where two of the variables each have 1,000 or so categories and the number of cells (combinations of variable values) is a the millions. The methodology discussed here is directly	reens on this example. As described in more duration in Sec- tion 4, the U. S. Foed and Ding Administration (FDA) Sportnaeous Reporting System (SRS) database consists of reports of medical events happening to patients taking var- ious drugs. This article presents an aralysis in which N _{RR} are the counts of the number of reports involving drug i
Within the Monteki in a Training Construct with T in the Joseph Monteki in a Training State of the State St	Basing $\alpha = 1208$ levels) and evels j flowing is $= 952$ levels) strained by $\alpha = 18$ combinations of report data and reported gender of the packon. (There were its live- year time period symposympt and these gender report leads allocations: mark, ferale, and unreported gender). Thus, $M = 952 \times 108 \times 1023$, which is the symposizing of even reputation, similar for each time period report and maximum. The gas in two severest if the direct-vector configura- tions for possible further investigation. The following de-
© 1900 American Sectorized American	The American Banchism, Samuel 1999, Vol. 53, No. 3 177

William DuMouchel, "Bayesian data mining in large frequency tables, with an application to the FDA spontaneous reporting system," American Statistician, 1999; 53:177–90.



Guidance for surveillance of "spontaneous reporting systems" is well developed in the scientific literature



William DuMouchel, "Bayesian Measurement of Associations in Adverse Drug Reaction Databases," SAMSI Workshop on Data Mining and Machine Learning, September 8, 2003.



NHTSA's Early Warning Reporting data allows surveillance for potential motor vehicle defects using statistical techniques for exploratory analysis

DEFEC	RN	S8	RE	RECALLS			Manufac	turer Login
NFORMATION				DOWNLOADS		DOCUMENTS		
Getting Started FAQ News US State Codes & Foreign Country Names NEW! Search EWR Data				Microsoft® Excel Templa XML Instances XML Schema NHTSA EWR XML Validat Contact EWR Helpdesk (202) 366-3348 mfrewrhelpdesk@dot.gov	EWR Manufacturer Account Application Compendiums Confidentiality Requests Legal Interpretations Field Report Submissions WinSCP Instructions PSETP Instructions			
The following table Substantially Simil	e lists Iar Ve	the EWR	subm the m	nission time periods for Aggrega nost recent quarter.	ate data, Death	and Injury dat	a, Field Rep	orts, and
Year Quarter Rep 2010 3 Age			Rep	oort Type	Begin Date	End Date	Days	
			Agg	regate	10/1/2010	11/30/201	0 60	
			Dea	th and Injury	10/1/2010	11/30/201	0 60	
			Fiel	d Reports	10/1/2010	12/15/201	0 75	
			Sub	stantially Similar Vehicles	8/2/2010	11/1/2010	91	
Last updated Sept	temb	er 16, 2010	0					1







QCS



57











Step 6. Calculate similar scores for every component in every fleet in the dataset

						Fle	et a	nd C	omp	one	nt				Sco	re	
	FORD TRUCK EXPLORER 4D 4X2 2002 Visibility									4.6	4.63635962						
	F	FORD TRUCK F350 CREW C PU 4X4 2004 Engine & Engine Cooling								4.18304586							
	JEEP LIBERTY 4D 4X4 2002 Suspension								4.4	4.41496598							
	L	EXUS	ES 3	50 4	1D 20	007	Spee	d Co	ontrol					8.3	8.34231273		
	Т	OYO	TA C	AMR	Y 4D	2WD	200	07 Sp	peed	Cont	trol			4.2	2001	424	3
								1			l						



Example of a potential defect surveillance list based on NHTSA's Early Warning data for injuries

This Period	Fleet - Component	Last Period	Times on List	Notes
1	LEXUS ES 350 4D 2007 - Speed Control	-	3	Possibly related recall 07E082000
2	FORD TRUCK EXPLORER 4D 4X2 2002 - Visibility	3	10	Possibly related recall <u>07E104000</u> Possibly related "special service campaign" <u>011010000</u>
3	JEEP LIBERTY 4D 4X4 2002 - Suspension	-	1	Possibly related recall <u>03V460000</u>
4	TOYOTA CAMRY 4D 2WD 2007 - Speed Control	-	1	Possibly related recall <u>07E082000</u>
5	FORD TRUCK F350 CREW C PU 4X4 2004 - Engine & Engine Cooling	-	1	Possibly related petition, but no recall <u>DP05005</u>

Step 7. Rank the scores in a list



Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Early Warning Reporting data through the first quarter of 2008, Rankings by Quality Control Systems Corp.

Technical details and examples are described here:

URIGINAL I							
Improving motor vehi	surveillance for injuries associated with potential cle safety defects						
R A Whitfield, A K Whitfield							
	Injury Prevention 2004, M288–92. doi: 10.1126/(p.2003.002699						
See and gl orticle for outburt diffestors Correspondence to: Wr R A Whithed, Gonity Correl System Grap. 1014 Plan Greek Grap. 1014 Plan Greek Direct Correlations, MD gardrenal.com	Objection: To improve somelines for effects and strain associated with pathod how which each provides in a strain or other as the studied increasing and the strain of any strain design. The state is and strain and strai						
when the second	 Indicate and the left biological processing of the left biole						

R. A. Whitfield, and Alice K. Whitfield, "Improving Surveillance for Injuries Associated with Potential Motor Vehicle Safety Defects." Injury Prevention, April 2004, 10:88-92.



Statistical surveillance techniques are known to work for problems involved in unintended acceleration from NHTSA's Early Warning Reporting injury claims data

This Period	Fleet - Component	Last Period	Times on List	Notes
1	LEXUS ES 350 4D 2007 - Speed	-	3	Possibly related recall 07E082000
	Control			
2	FORD TRUCK EXPLORER 4D 4X2	3	10	Possibly related recall
	2002 - Visibility			<u>07E104000</u>
				Possibly related "special service
				campaign"
				<u>011010000</u>
3	JEEP LIBERTY 4D 4X4 2002 -	-	1	Possibly related recall
	Suspension			<u>03V460000</u>
4	TOYOTA CAMRY 4D 2WD 2007 -	-	1	Possibly related recall
	Speed Control			<u>07E082000</u>
5	FORD TRUCK F350 CREW C PU 4X4	-	1	Possibly related
	2004 - Engine & Engine Cooling			petition,
				but no recall
				<u>DP05005</u>



Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation,

Early Warning Reporting date through the first quarter of 2008,

Rankings by Quality Control Systems Corp.

There is no certainty that <u>any</u> vehicle / component identified as a candidate for further review by these methods will have a safety related defect.



It is unlikely that <u>only</u> vehicles / components with high surveillance scores could have a safety related defect.



Integration with recall data is extremely helpful, especially to recognize possibly ineffective recalls

This Period	Fleet - Component	Last Period	Times on List	Notes
1	LEXUS ES 350 4D 2007 - Speed			Possibly related recall 07E082000
	Control			
2	FORD TRUCK EXPLORER 4D 4X2	3	10	Possibly related recall
	2002 - Visibility			<u>07E104000</u>
				Possibly related "special service
				campaign"
				<u>011010000</u>
3	JEEP LIBERTY 4D 4X4 2002 -	-	1	Possibly related recall
	Suspension			<u>03V460000</u>
4	TOYOTA CAMRY 4D 2WD 2007 -		1	Possibly related recall
	Speed Control			<u>07E082000</u>
5	FORD TRUCK F350 CREW C PU 4X4	-	1	Possibly related
	2004 - Engine & Engine Cooling			petition,
				but no recall
				DP05005



Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation, Early Warning Reporting data through the first quarter of 2008, Rankings by Quality Control Systems Corp.

Integration with related complaint data is also helpful to understand the context of identified issues

This Period	Fleet	- Component	Last Period	Times on List	Notes
1	LEXUS ES 350	4D 2007 - Speed	-	3	Possibly related recall 07E082000
	Control	SEARCH FOR	COMPLAIN	TS	
2	FORD TRUCK	You are here: Home / Ve	ehicle Owners / Searc	h Complaints	
	2002 - Visibility				He
		The Safety Complain motor vehicle equipme	ts Search Engine allow ant by make, model and	vs searches of safet year.	y-related complaints about motor vehicles an
		If known, enter the con Equipment, Child Rest	nplaint ODI number(s) i raint or Tires from the li	in the text box on the ist on the right below	e left below. Otherwise select Vehicle, . Then use the appropriate Search button to
3	JEEP LIBERTY	continue.			
4	Suspension				
4		Select » 🔟 T	ype 🛛 🛛 Yea	r 📑 Mak	e Model 🔄 Component
5			50	leat the TVDE of Co	
Э	FORD TRUCK		Sel	lect the ITPE of Se	arch
	2004 - Engine a	5	(e.g. 1038567,10	nder(s):)39464)	Vehicle
					Equipment
					Child Restraint
			Search]	O Tires
		(Multiple C	ODI numbers must be	separated by comr	mas) Search Selected Type
				- B	· · ·



Source: NHTSA, Office of Defects Investigation

Related technical report and sponsorship details are available at:

http://www.safetyresearch.net/Library/QCSReport00203.pdf



The statistical research involving NHTSA's Early Warning Reporting System and the associated, published article on surveillance for motor vehicle safety related defects was supported solely by Quality Control Systems Corp.



Note that statistics involving NHTSA's Consumer Safety Complaint data were developed for research projects sponsored by law firms representing plaintiffs in litigation with Toyota Motor Company.



Thank You.